

Document of
The World Bank

Report No: 29102

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT
(PPFI-P9080 PPFI-P9081 IF-N0310)

ON A

CREDIT

IN THE AMOUNT OF US\$ 7 MILLION

TO THE

COMOROS

FOR A

THIRD EDUCATION PROJECT

June 10, 2004

Human Development Group III
Africa Region

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective 31/12/2003)

Currency Unit = Comorian Francs (KMF)

SDR 1.00 = US\$ 1.46254000

US\$ 1.00 = KMF 401.75

FISCAL YEAR

July 1 June 30

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
CGPE	<i>Cellule de Gestion du Projet Education</i>
CIPR	<i>Circonscription d'Inspection Pédagogique Régionale</i>
CIEP	<i>Centre International d'Etudes Pédagogiques</i>
CPPR	Country Portfolio Performance Review
DER	<i>Direction Exécutive Régionale</i>
EFA/NAP	Education For All/National Action Plan
GER	Gross Enrollment Rate
ICR	Implementation Completion Report
IFERE	<i>Institut de Formation des Enseignants et de Recherche en Education</i>
MINEDAF	<i>Conférence des Ministres de l'Education pour l'Afrique</i>
MLA	Monitoring Learning Achievement
MOE	Ministry of Education
MTR	Mid-Term-Review
NER	Net Enrollment Rate
OFTP	<i>Office pour la Formation Technique et Professionnelle</i>
OVT	Vocational Training Office
PCD	Project Concept Document
PMU	Project Management Unit
PRET	Program for the Reinforcement of Education and Training
QAG	Quality Assurance Group
QSR	Quality of Supervision Report
SAR	Staff Appraisal Report
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
VT	Vocational Training

Vice President:	Callisto E. Madavo
Country Director	Hafez Ghanem
Sector Manager	Laura Frigenti
Task Team Leader:	Jacob Bregman

COMOROS
Third Education Project

CONTENTS

	Page No.
1. Project Data	1
2. Principal Performance Ratings	1
3. Assessment of Development Objective and Design, and of Quality at Entry	2
4. Achievement of Objective and Outputs	5
5. Major Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcome	11
6. Sustainability	12
7. Bank and Borrower Performance	13
8. Lessons Learned	15
9. Partner Comments	16
10. Additional Information	16
Annex 1. Key Performance Indicators/Log Frame Matrix	17
Annex 2. Project Costs and Financing	18
Annex 3. Economic Costs and Benefits	20
Annex 4. Bank Inputs	21
Annex 5. Ratings for Achievement of Objectives/Outputs of Components	23
Annex 6. Ratings of Bank and Borrower Performance	24
Annex 7. List of Supporting Documents	25
Annex 8. Borrower's Final Project Evaluation	26

<i>Project ID:</i> P000603	<i>Project Name:</i> Third Education Project
<i>Team Leader:</i> Jacob H. Bregman	<i>TL Unit:</i> AFTH3
<i>ICR Type:</i> Core ICR	<i>Report Date:</i> June 18, 2004

1. Project Data

Name: Third Education Project

L/C/TF Number: PPF1-P9080; PPF1-P9081;
IF-N0310

Country/Department: COMOROS

Region: Africa Regional Office

Sector/subsector: Primary education (65%); Vocational training (14%); Central government administration (11%); Sub-national government administration (10%)

Theme: Education for all (P); Education for the knowledge economy (P); Social risk reduction (P); Gender (S); Participation and civic engagement (S)

KEY DATES

PCD: 04/02/1992
Appraisal: 02/21/1997
Approval: 06/30/1997

	<i>Original</i>	<i>Revised/Actual</i>
<i>Effective:</i>	06/23/2000	06/23/2000
<i>MTR:</i>	10/15/2001	10/15/2001
<i>Closing:</i>	12/31/2002	12/31/2003

Borrower/Implementing Agency: GOVERNMENT OF COMOROS/MINISTRY OF EDUCATION

Other Partners:

STAFF

	<i>Current</i>	<i>At Appraisal</i>
<i>Vice President:</i>	Callisto E. Madavo	Callisto E. Madavo
<i>Country Director:</i>	Hafez M. H. Ghanem	Andrew Rogerson
<i>Sector Manager:</i>	Laura Frigenti	Arvil van Adams
<i>Team Leader at ICR:</i>	Jacob Bregman	
<i>ICR Primary Author:</i>	Patrick Philippe Ramanantoanina	

2. Principal Performance Ratings

(HS=Highly Satisfactory, S=Satisfactory, U=Unsatisfactory, HL=Highly Likely, L=Likely, UN=Unlikely, HUN=Highly Unlikely, HU=Highly Unsatisfactory, H=High, SU=Substantial, M=Modest, N=Negligible)

Outcome: S
Sustainability: UN
Institutional Development Impact: M
Bank Performance: S
Borrower Performance: U

QAG (if available)

ICR

Quality at Entry: U

Project at Risk at Any Time: Yes

3. Assessment of Development Objective and Design, and of Quality at Entry

3.1 Original Objective:

The Comoros Education III project was approved on June 30, 1997, and the legal documents were signed on October 24, 1997. However, due to the instability of the changing political situation in the country at the time and the accumulation of arrears by the Comoros, which led to a suspension of disbursements in August 1998, effectiveness was delayed until June 23, 2000. The Comoros Education III project, which was a follow-up to two previous Bank-funded Education projects, is being assessed in the context of (i) the political instability of the country since 1997; (ii) the economic context throughout the life of the project; (iii) the shortage of local capacity to implement such a project; and (iv) the newly decentralized government structure following the elections in 2002, which led to continuous disagreements on power-sharing between the central and local governments (at the island level).

Over the years, the unsolved political crisis in Comoros hampered the education sector. More than one-third of school-age children did not attend formal schooling at primary level and, among those who completed the six-year primary cycle, only about 40 percent continued onwards to lower secondary. In 1995-96, net enrollment ratios at primary education (55 percent), lower secondary (9 percent) and upper secondary (2 percent) were very low. Access to primary education was constrained by limited space in existing classrooms. In addition, participation in education was limited as a result of low internal efficiency and poor quality. The public education system was particularly affected due to sporadic teacher strikes shortening the school year to less than 100 days (a normal school year is about 180 days). Drastic shortages of school materials and poor management also contributed to the deterioration in quality. The Government was facing a shortage of resources due to (i) a back payment of teachers' salaries of about 19 months and (ii) a lack of recurrent budget for public primary schools (the share for teachers' salaries was about 99 percent of the regular education budget). The number of students enrolled in primary private schools increased from 5 percent in 1997 to 11 percent in 2000, and large numbers of qualified teachers left public schools for private ones, increasing inequity and the dropout rate of poor children.

The context in Comoros was expected to further improve at project effectiveness date. Political arrangements were reached between the three islands. The Government complied with international obligations and restarted paying civil servant salary. Unfortunately, over the years the Government was not able to solve the dispute on competencies sharing between the three islands; a national consolidated budget has never been agreed and the issue on teachers' salary arrears remained unresolved. Hence, during its life, the project was facing persistent risks of school disruption and teachers' strikes.

The project had three objectives in the Staff Appraisal Report (SAR), (i) improving primary education, (ii) establishing an effective demand-driven training system to develop the skilled labor force and developing effective project management. By increasing local participation in school management and improving input quality at school level, the project was expected to contribute to (i) the increase of enrollment at the primary level and (ii) the effectiveness of the teaching-learning process. Through the creation of an autonomous institution, the project should contribute to the creation of a vocational training (VT) system that could respond to the labor market and to the need to increase productivity. The third objective was to support the development of effective project management capacity among the staff in the Project Management Unit (PMU) and improve the skills of local authorities in the planning, execution, monitoring and evaluation of project-financed activities.

The objectives of the project were relevant and corresponded to the government strategy for the sector, as expressed in the 1996 Program for the Reinforcement of Education and Training (PRET). The focus of the

PRET was essentially on improving access to quality education at the primary level and developing skills for the labor market. The project was also congruent with two of the objectives of the Bank's Mini CAS for the Comoros (1995), namely poverty reduction and human capital development. Given the chronically weak public finances, the Bank sought also to support community development, focusing on projects that relied on communities themselves for successful implementation.

Even though the project addressed different education-related issues, it was treated as an infrastructure investment. Apart from the rehabilitation/construction of classrooms and the provision of textbooks, the activities and results targeted by the project were not well identified. The budget for the different activities, namely those related to improving the quality and skills of teachers, school administrators and pedagogical supervisors, was not clearly allocated. The second objective of setting up a VT demand-driven system was very ambitious, particularly in the context of the under-development of the private sector in Comoros.

3.2 Revised Objective:

The project objectives were not revised during the life of the project either after the Country Project Portfolio Review (CPPR) in 2000 nor the Mid-Term Review (MTR) in 2001.

3.3 Original Components:

Originally, the Third Education Project, to be implemented over a five-year period (1997-2002), was composed of five components, corresponding to the three objectives.

Objective 1: Improve Primary Education (Original cost US\$4.5 million or 65 % of the total base cost; final cost US\$4.8 million or 70 % of the total cost). This objective was composed of two sub-components:

Component 1.1: Improve Participation in Primary Education. The project aimed to improve community participation by establishing school committees that would be involved in three areas: (i) construction and maintenance of school facilities; (ii) procurement of textbooks; and (iii) management of operating funds. Additionally, the project would finance construction and/or rehabilitation of, and the furnishing of, 220 classrooms in some 120 schools located in the poorest areas of the three islands, providing an additional 3,600 student slots.

Component 1.2: Improve Quality of Education. The component included: (i) better management practices for school directors; (ii) the provision of teaching-learning materials; (iii) the development of teaching-learning methods for the teachers in the project-area schools; and (iv) learning assessment and education information systems. The project also financed school supervision practices by (i) providing equipment, specialist services, training materials, training of supervisory staff, and (ii) monitoring and evaluating the impact of supervision on learning.

Objective 2: Improve skilled labour training (Original cost US\$1 million or 14 % of total base; final cost US\$860,000 or 13 % of the total cost). This objective included two activities.

Component 2.1: Establishment of a Functional Vocational Training System. The project would finance investment and operating costs needed for the Vocational Training Office (OVT) and its units.

Component 2.2: Development of Skills for Skilled Labor. It included the establishment of (i) a Vocational Training Fund, (ii) Training Program Development and Instructor Training Units, and (iii) Institutional Development Support for the existing vocational training institutions.

Objective 3: Develop Effective Project Management (Original cost US\$800,000 or 11 % of total base cost; final cost US\$700,000 or 10 % of the total cost).

The project supported the creation of the PMU, including the rehabilitation of the building and the operating costs for the PMU and the development of an information management system. The description of the project in the Development Credit Agreement was amended in October 2002 to include capacity building in the central Ministry of Education (MOE) and Regional Directorates of Education on each island, particularly in planning, monitoring and evaluation.

For objectives 1 and 3, under relatively normal implementation conditions and adequate financing, the components identified should have been able to ensure the achievement of the project's objectives. With regard to the second objective, the project was very ambitious and the components identified were quite unrealistic in the Comorian context.

The project design was confusing and the outputs and outcomes were not clearly established. Those weaknesses in the project design were reflected into the logical framework in the SAR where project outputs and outcomes are mixed up. Most of the indicators were either not appropriately defined or were not relevant. With respect to the third objective, the identified indicators should be viewed as conditions of success rather than Project performance indicators. The counterparts complained about difficulties in measuring most of the indicators, and it was agreed with the new team (appointed by the Bank in 2001) to select more appropriate indicators for project monitoring and assessment.

3.4 Revised Components:

The components were not revised during the life of the project.

3.5 Quality at Entry:

Quality at Entry is rated unsatisfactory.

The Project at the design phase was congruent with the Bank's priorities and orientations for the country. The 1994 *Poverty Assessment* concluded that major improvements in poverty reduction were to be made through: (a) overall equitable economic growth; and (b) improved public services to the poor, especially in primary education and basic health care. The Mini-CAS of June 1995 recommended continued assistance to macro-economic and structural reforms initiated in the early 1990s through a proposed structural adjustment credit, and support to sectoral operations in the Agriculture/Environment and Education sectors. During implementation, the project remained in line with the 2000 *Interim Support Strategy* focusing on enhanced portfolio management with emphasis on projects in the social sector (health care, family planning and primary education).

The project design reflects some of the lessons learned from the Second Education Project, in particular the need to link the design of the projects with the government's own sectoral strategy. The Government held a national conference in 1992, which was followed by a national consultation on education in June/July 1994 and the preparation of a Program for the Reinforcement of Education and Training (PRET) in 1996. During the negotiations of the project, the Government confirmed its commitment to implementing the PRET and specifically the objectives of its five-year program (1997-2002) to improve access to quality basic education and develop skills for the labor market.

The following risks were raised in the SAR: (i) Government commitment to put the structural adjustment program back on track and thus provide the appropriate level of public resources in the sector was unclear; (ii) MOE's capacity to follow through on commitments and the local communities' ability to take responsibility for school management remained largely untested; and (iii) teacher unions might continue to disrupt operation of the public education system.

Although many aspects of the project design were sound, quality at entry is nonetheless rated unsatisfactory, because:

- (a) The mitigating measures proposed to manage the risks were not well identified.
- (b) The project-monitoring plan was not included in the project design.
- (c) The project was very ambitious and the design very complex, encompassing numerous objectives, components and sub-components. Some inconsistencies were observed on objectives and components. Moreover, the project required mobilization of numerous educational experts and specialized institutions at the local level, particularly for quality-related activities. Such capacity was not well assessed at appraisal.
- (d) Community capacity to contribute to the funding of school construction was not well assessed. Lack of resources at the community level was only raised after project implementation started.
- (e) The links between the objectives, activities, results and the financial resources allocated are not clear and seems to have been under-evaluated at the design phase.
- (f) During appraisal, the second objective related to VT was not well assessed. The lack of information on employment stressed in the SAR should have led to a prior analysis of the labor market and the private sector. This should have provided information on the extent to which the establishment of a Fund for a demand-driven VT system was realistic in the Comorian context.

4. Achievement of Objective and Outputs

4.1 Outcome/achievement of objective:

Achievement of objectives and outcomes under the Comoros Education III project was satisfactory. Despite the difficulties encountered during implementation, the project succeeded in achieving its objectives in a three-year period (2000-2003) instead of five years as originally planned. This was made possible by the creation of Regional Executive Directorates on each island, thereby avoiding political interference with project implementation. The project was focused on the first component, improving primary education, which represents about 70% of the total cost. The Bank-funded project was the main resource for improving the education sector in Comoros, therefore progress in this sector depended primarily on its activities.

The first objective -- improving primary education -- is considered as achieved. The project contributed significantly to improvements in school environment. It succeeded in (i) providing the education sector with the qualified staff needed for school supervision, and (ii) promoting school community support. In addition, teachers were paid regularly, although the dilemma of back payments remained unsolved. As a consequence, teachers and parents regained confidence in public education, access to public primary schools improved, and community involvement in school supervision drastically reduced teacher absenteeism.

At the project closing date (i) the school year had been increased to 180 days, up from 100 days in the previous years, and (ii) student enrollment improved in primary education. The Gross Entry Rate in first grade increased from 80 % in 1998/1999 to 90 % in 2002/2003. The number of primary students

increased, particularly in Anjouan and Moheli where it increased by an average 7 % and 5 % per year respectively. In Grand Comore, the increase in primary education students was more congruent with demographic growth (2.5 %). The Gross Enrollment Rate increased slowly from 92 % in 1998/1999 to 101 % in 2002/2003. During project implementation, enrollment of girls improved in Anjouan and Moheli; however, for the whole of Comoros, the gender parity index stabilized to about 0.86 due to a large increase in enrollment of boys (107 % in 2002/2003) in Grand Comore. A household survey done in late 2002 revealed that poor students benefited as much from education public expenditures as rich students.

Table 1 : Evolution of main key indicators - 1999 to 2003

	1998/1999	2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003
Gross Entry Rate in first grade (%)	80%	NA	86%	90%
Gross Enrolment Rate (%)	92%	NA	97%	101%
Number of students in primary education	82,789	91,552	94,249	97,405
Gender parity index in Comoros	0.86	NA	0.87	0.85
· Grande Comore	1.00	NA	0.98	0.87
· Anjouan	0.72	NA	0.75	0.84
· Moheli	0.78	NA	0.78	0.84

Sources: Ministries of Education – Tableaux de bord

The project succeeded in providing the inputs to address the low quality of education. However, the impact on quality of the provision of student textbooks and teaching/learning materials, and the appointment of 15 inspectors in the CIPR structures and 29 counselors in the pedagogical zones, will only be noticeable in the years following project completion. At project completion, the repetition rate still remained high, at about 26 % in Grande Comore, 29 % in Moheli and 27 % in Anjouan.

The second objective, related to vocational training, was partially achieved. The OVT, through the Fund, established a non-formal training mechanism for private sector firms/associations and community associations. It also promoted the development of private training providers. Few results were achieved with regards to institutional development of existing vocational training institutions.

The third objective -- developing effective project management -- was achieved. The PMU and its DERs were set up and became operational. They were able to manage the financial aspects, comply with Bank procedures and implement all activities on time. All audit reports were unqualified. Despite the changing institutional context, the project succeeded in supporting the MOEs in producing the Education Status Yearbook after two years of disruption, thereby providing data needed for the monitoring and evaluation of the project outcomes.

4.2 Outputs by components:

The outputs achieved by component should be assessed taking into account the reduced project budget and the implementation period. Following the decisions of the CPPR and the MTR (which led to the elimination of Government and community counterpart financing) and the depreciation of the US dollar, the financing of the project was reduced by around US\$800,000. This resulted in partial achievement of some of the project's anticipated outputs.

Objective 1: Improve Primary Education

Component 1.1: Improve Participation in Primary Education

This component is rated satisfactory. The following elements support this rating.

Community Participation. The Government showed commitment towards the project by formalizing the legal status of school committees in 1999. School committees were set up for all 248 primary public schools (50 by UNICEF). This improved supervision of school staff and teacher attendance, and restored parents' confidence in the public school system. It also resulted in greater financial contribution by local communities to school financing mainly through the creation of the textbook rental fund. All committee members were trained in the responsibilities of school committees. In Moheli, additional training on school management was also provided to committee members.

Infrastructure Improvement. The original target of 220 classrooms in 120 public primary schools to be built or rehabilitated was reviewed after the MTR, in light of the construction cost increase. The cost increased due to the devaluation of the US dollar and the additional construction of latrines, school offices and storage facilities. The targets were thus reduced to construction/rehabilitation of 146 classrooms in about 83 public primary schools (over the existing 289 public primary schools). Schools were selected according to enrolment demand at the community level (urban and rural). Without the project, the 83 selected schools would have been forced to organize triple shifts, hence reducing student learning time and access to primary education for poor student.

The project contributed to an increase in classroom capacity of about 21 % in Moheli, 14 % in the Grande Comore, and 9 % in Anjouan. At project completion, despite the reduction of classrooms to be refurbished/constructed, an average ratio of around 38 students per classroom was reached on the basis of a double shift in schools. However, some disparities are observed across the three islands: in Moheli and Grande Comore, a significant number of classrooms have less than 30 students (35% and 40%); while in Anjouan only 4 % of classrooms have less than 30 students.

All infrastructure projects included latrines, offices for school directors and storage facilities. In Moheli and Anjouan, the objective of furnishing all constructed/rehabilitated classrooms was met. However, in the Grande Comore, the available budget only allowed for furnishing half of constructed/rehabilitated classrooms.

Table 2 : Construction/rehabilitation of Classrooms

	Grde Comore	Moheli	Anjouan	Total
Number of schools that benefited from classrooms construction/rehabilitation	52	10	21	83
Number of classrooms rehabilitated/constructed	83	18	45	146
Number of classrooms constructed	47	11	26	84
In rural area	91%	82%	81%	87%
In urban area	9%	18%	19%	13%
Number of classrooms rehabilitated	36	7	19	62
In rural area	94%	100%	58%	84%
In urban area	6%	0%	42%	16%
% of constructed classrooms that have been furnished	68%	100%	100%	82%
% of rehabilitated classrooms that have been furnished	55%	100%	100%	74%

Component 1.2: Improve Quality in Primary Education

This component is rated satisfactory. This rating takes into account the country context, where conditions were not conducive to implement a consistent program on Quality in Primary Education in Comoros. Only 40% of public primary teachers were qualified. Human resources to implement activities such as teacher training and school supervision were lacking and capacity of the existing teacher training institution was very weak. Moreover, the school environment was not appropriate to implementing an effective action plan on improving teaching and learning methodologies. Consequently and in spite of the numerous activities under this component, priority was given to activities that were expected (i) to face the shortage of teaching-learning materials at school, (ii) to have direct impact on student learning outcomes, and (iii) to prepare further actions on quality. To that end, two main activities were fully achieved: (i) the provision of one textbook per subject per student, and (ii) the training of education staff needed for teacher training and school supervision. The remaining activities were partially achieved and implemented based on the available budget and the project's timetable.

Areas of priority

Teaching-Learning Materials. 262,272 textbooks were provided by the project; 87,424 in each of three subjects (mathematics, sciences and French). This led to a ratio of almost one book per student per subject (0.93 in school year 2002-2003). The difference is accounted for by the new schools that had not been included in the school mapping. However, each school committee created a rental fee system through which they are able to buy new textbooks. A rental fee of 500 Comorian Francs (CF) per textbook is charged to students. An amount to 131,136,000 CF was expected for the school year 2002-2003, which corresponded to some 65,000 new books. Such a revolving fund should allow for the recovery of the initial textbook investment over a four- to five-year period.

Table 3 : Textbook delivery for the 2002-2003 school year

	Number of public primary students	Number of textbooks provided per subject per student	Textbook per subject per student	% of student who do not have one textbook per subject
Ngazidja	45 354	42 619	0.94	6%
Ndzuani	42 522	39 102	0.92	8%
Mwali	5 969	5 703	0.96	4%
Ensemble	93 845	87 424	0.93	7%

Source : Reports of the DERs and the CGPE

The project provided some 4,636 teacher manuals (no teacher manuals for science were acquired). Although the rate of one textbook per subject per student was reached, the program (originally to be implemented by the IFERE) to train the 2,383 teachers on the use of the manuals could not be implemented entirely. Only 38 % of the teachers of Moheli attended such training.

The project also provided public primary schools with pedagogical kits. Around 1,800 kits for teachers were acquired. Since the number was insufficient for all public primary teachers, priority was given to the most qualified teachers and those with the most years of experience. At the start of the 2001-2002 and 2002-2003 school years, the project provided all public primary schools with basic school materials.

Supervision Practices. The project addressed the strategic issue of the shortage of qualified supervision staff --a major constraint in achieving quality improvement in school. Taking into account the lack of qualified inspectors and counselors, the project financed the training of 15 new inspectors in Madagascar and supported *IFERE* in training 29 pedagogical counselors. At the completion of the Project, all 16 *CIPRs* and 45 pedagogical zones were staffed with the required qualified human resources for school supervision. Moreover, the education sector is now staffed to support a large teacher training program. The project provided the *CIPRs* with the required equipment and vehicles to support inspectors in supervision activities. In June 2003, an international consultant reviewed the current supervision practices and teacher training. A number of recommendations were proposed in order to pursue the education staff training and the reform of the education supervision.

Secondary activities

Better Management Practices and Teaching and learning methods. The project was to provide in-service teacher and school director training. Priority was given to newly recruited and unqualified teachers (a total of 771). With the available budget, 41 % of school directors received training, principally in Anjouan and Moheli, and 48 % of newly recruited and unqualified teachers benefited from the training program.

Learning Assessment and Education Information Systems. UNICEF financed the 2000 Monitoring Learning Achievement (MLA) Assessment Study thus making it irrelevant for the project to do so.

Objective 2: Improve Skilled Labour Training

Component 2.1: Establish a Performing Vocational Training System

This component is rated marginally satisfactory. The project fulfilled the objective stipulated in the SAR, in supporting the creation of the “*Office pour la Formation Technique et Professionnelle*” (*OFTP*). However, the *OFTP* never achieved the leadership role required to set up a sustainable demand-driven vocational training system. During implementation, it focused essentially on promoting and managing the Vocational Training Fund. Actions on restructuring the Vocational Training System were not implemented due to low capacity in the private sector and the unpredictable political environment

At the end of the Project, capacity building was only limited to the *OFTP* and the financial viability of *OFTP* is questionable. A study on the financing of the vocational training system was undertaken by international consultants to provide the Government with recommendations and orientations for the reform of the VET system.

Component 2.2: Develop Competencies for Skilled Labor

This component is rated unsatisfactory. Despite the impressive number of subprojects financed and beneficiaries trained, the assessment of training subprojects raised the issue of the economic rate of return and the benefit for the trainees. The assessment of 17 training subprojects led to a conclusion that although half of the trainees were already working, those in the informal sector were either unable to find work after the training period, or could not increase their revenues or productivity. The Fund created a new mechanism for training but did not contribute significantly to setting up a demand-driven system. This is also due to the Comorian context, which is characterized by a major informal economy, a high level of unemployment, and a very low education-expectancy in life. The budget overrun did not allow for an overall assessment of the impact of the project on productivity and individual return.

Vocational Training Fund. The project set up a Vocational Training Fund (US\$400,000) to finance demand-driven training activities. The manual of procedures was prepared and agreed during project negotiations. On the whole, the project largely achieved its targets for the number of subprojects and beneficiaries. Around 150 training sub-projects benefiting more than 4,300 trainees were financed by the funds. The Fund's initial objective was to finance some 50 sub-projects (800 trainees) over a five-year period.

Program Development and Instructor Training Unit. The Program Development and Instructor Training Unit is not fully operational. A national consultant was recruited as director of this unit early 2003 and left after a few 6 months for another job. The project was not able to retain him and did not choose to replace him since the project was nearly completed. However, through the implementation of the sub-projects around 60 training programs, are available at the project closing.

Institutional Development for the Existing Vocational Training Institutions. A study of the VT institutions was financed to design an action plan for institutional development. Part of the action plan was undertaken, particularly the training recommendations. Those related to institutional reform were ignored. This situation led to an improvement of individual technical capacities rather than institutional ones. However, a few activities deserve attention, namely distance learning activities that are appropriate to the Comoros context.

Objective 3: Develop Effective Project Management

The component is rated satisfactory. In the context of Comoros, creating an independent PMU was the most effective way to implement the project. This allowed the project avoid effects of the changing institutional environment on its implementation. At the beginning, the project was slow in finding an office for the PMU. However, the PMU was set up and operational in a reasonable period of time, thus enabling project completion in the reduced period of three years. The project completed the decentralization of management. The DERs were set up, staffed, and equipped, and sub accounts were set up at their level. Project management improved gradually. Specific training was carried out for the staff, and the manual Information Management System was replaced by a computerized one with technical assistance from an international firm. Reverse supervision missions were held in Madagascar to benefit the PMU Staff from the Madagascar Education PMU. Financial audits resulted in unqualified reports.

Capacity-building activities in the education management field were added during the amendment in June 2002. Given the prevailing institutional context, little transfer of capacity to the ministries of education on each island was achieved. The project's activities were limited to supporting the MOEs in producing and publishing the statistical yearbook on education, which had been interrupted during the years 1999-2001. This also allowed for the follow-up of the project outcomes by the PMU and the Bank. Further to the break-up of the central Ministry of Education into three ministries on each island in June 2002, the project established a new strategy to address the huge lack of capacity at the island level. Specific training on education planning and data management were organized by the CIEP of Reunion for MOE staff. At project completion, Grande Comore and Moheli were able to produce the Education Status Yearbook in a timely manner. However, Anjouan is still facing difficulties to produce a reliable document.

Most of the PMU staff were civil servants before being assigned to the PMU. They benefited from a series of classes to learn how to comply with the requirements for project management and implementation. At project close these staff will be reinserted into their original posts, bringing their new knowledge and experience to the MOE.

In view of the process of the Education For All National Plan (EFA/NAP), in conjunction with the elaboration of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Program, the project supported the Government in undertaking the Education Household and school surveys. Both activities resulted in the production of a draft Sector Note and a draft of EFA/NAP.

4.3 Net Present Value/Economic rate of return:

N/A

4.4 Financial rate of return:

N/A

4.5 Institutional development impact:

The project's impact on institutional development is modest. It should be noted that the reorganization of the institutional environment in 2002 with the creation of three local MOE, one per island, increased the level of difficulty in achieving institutional development objectives.

One of the most important contributions of the project was in the creation and training of school committees. These committees play an important role in ensuring better management of school resources in the long run. So far, the local committees have already organized a textbook rental mechanism to meet school needs. The capacity of the local MOEs to produce education-monitoring frameworks (*tableaux de bord*) is also an important contribution of the project in terms of institutional development. However, its sustainability remains to be seen. The Bank, through the preparation of an Education Sector Note with the staff of the national and local education ministries (the first draft of which is currently being discussed with the Government), provided an interesting opportunity to improve the analytical capacity of these structures.

The 16 *CIPRs* and the 45 pedagogical zones are now well staffed and equipped to implement pedagogical supervision and activities required for quality improvement at the primary school level. However it is not certain that they will be provided with the appropriate financial resources to effectively assume their role after the end of the project.

5. Major Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcome

5.1 Factors outside the control of government or implementing agency:

Difficulties faced by local communities in financially contributing to the construction or rehabilitation of school infrastructure. The anticipated financial participation of the local communities in the financing of this project component was not realistically evaluated.

Increase in construction costs. The increase in such costs may have negatively affected the project and significantly reduced project outputs. Because of the increased cost of construction, a certain number of training activities designed to improve local capacity were not undertaken.

5.2 Factors generally subject to government control:

The creation of local Ministries of Education and the weak capacities of their structures. The creation in 2002 of local governments on each island required frequent adjustments, thus resulting in delays in

implementation and increased costs. The creation of one MOE per island and the decision to involve local structures (*CIPR*) in implementing quality-related activities slowed down implementation, particularly in regards to the training of education staff, planning, and monitoring and evaluation. The regional and local structures were not staffed, nor equipped to undertake such activities.

Delays in credit transfers in the first year of project implementation. Some delays in credit transfers due principally to problems within the commercial banking system and the Comoros Central Bank were responsible for initial delays in project implementation, namely with the payments of local construction entrepreneurs. Although some improvements occurred, this issue was observed throughout project implementation.

5.3 Factors generally subject to implementing agency control:

Lack of coordination between the structures of the PMU. The staff of the PMU was very competent and demonstrated ownership of the project. However, there was a lack of coordination and communication between the CGPE and the DER, particularly on budget follow-up and consolidation of commitment data. As a result, the overrun in budget commitment was identified only at the end of the project.

5.4 Costs and financing:

The project was implemented between June 2000 and December 2003, this includes a 12-month extension. In June 2000, an amendment was agreed upon, increasing the ratio of expenditures by the Bank to 100 percent. Delays in construction due to difficulties of poor communities in providing their contribution led to the decision to suppress the community financial contribution. Those decisions and the depreciation of the US dollar reduced the total credit amount from the US\$7.5 million reflected in the SAR, to around US\$6.7 million, i.e. about a 10 percent reduction.

In addition to the budget reduction, it was also agreed to reallocate the credit to better align the amounts per category with the real costs, with an increase, notably, for civil works, textbooks, training and consultants.

Disbursement was 100 %, i.e. an equivalent of SDR5.1 million. A budget overrun of about US\$410,000 was incurred by the PMU, due to poor budgetary management monitoring by the PMU and communication/coordination problems between the different entities of the PMU.

6. Sustainability

6.1 Rationale for sustainability rating:

Project sustainability is assessed as unlikely. Sufficient financial resources at the government level are critical to sustain project achievement, and at present there is a shortage. For the first component, no recurrent budget is expected to be available for improving quality at the school level. Despite the creation of the school committee rental funds, one textbook per student per subject will not be sustainable since the school committees need to face the financing of school recurrent costs. The project also contributed to an important increase in the number of satisfactory classrooms, sanitary facilities and school director offices reaching a national ratio of 38 students per classroom. Although this should respond to potential future demand (provided that the Government reviews school mapping), sustaining the current classroom capacity will remain a challenge due to the weak national/local capacity for maintenance of facilities.

Regarding the *OFTP*, the structure was operational only because the project took charge of the related operating costs, and the Training Fund was financed by the Credit. With the project closing, despite the

fact that the *OFTP* is a national institution, it is not certain that the Government of Comoros will provide the necessary and ongoing budget for its continued. It is unlikely that the Training Fund will be financed through public and/or private funds.

6.2 Transition arrangement to regular operations:

The Government of Comoros has indicated its strong commitment to participating in the Education For All (EFA) process. The project financed the participation of the Comorian representatives in the MINEDAF in Tanzania in October 2002. Following this meeting, a national committee was created and mandated to prepare an Education Sector Note and the EFA /NAP for the Comoros. The Bank and the Project supported the production of an Education Sector Note and provided the Government with the Bank financial model for the EFA.

The production of an Education Sector Note will help Government (national and local) determine its priorities and objectives in this sector and start addressing problems and constraints affecting the education system. The Education Sector Note will also help prepare the Government in its dialogue with other partners.

The EU plans to finance a comprehensive education sector program of 16 million Euros and a decentralization program of 4 million Euros. This program will build up project outcomes. The program would target and extend on a national basis, primary and secondary education and vocational training. In primary and secondary education, the emphasis would be on training of teachers, school officials and inspectors. In addition, the project would finance equipment, books, teaching and learning materials, furniture and selective rehabilitation of a few secondary schools. In the area of technical and vocational training, the project would support the creation of technical streams to provide a qualified labor force. Capacity building would be provided to enhance the management of the education system and support the national information system.

7. Bank and Borrower Performance

Bank

7.1 Lending:

The Bank team, throughout the project cycle, was very responsive to the needs and priorities of the Government. Prior to the design phase, the Bank supported the Government in the preparation of the Program for the Reinforcement of Education and Training (PRET) which involved direct participation of more than 200 representatives from all the national interest groups (public, private and communities) producing a long-term vision and investment priorities for the education system. The project design translated these priorities into objectives, components and outputs.

Nonetheless, during project preparation, the Bank's performance was weak. Even though the process of PRET had to be nationally driven, a comprehensive sector work should have been done to support policy dialogue with the Government. The lack of dialogue led to a very ambitious program that was only marginally achieved at the end of the period (1997-2002).

The second component on VT did not fit in to the Comoros context at the time and should have been cancelled. Due to political considerations, this was not possible at any time from project effectiveness throughout the project life.

7.2 Supervision:

A QAG/QSR Review was carried out in November 2001, one year after project effectiveness. An overall rating of 2 was given to the project team, and recommendations on reorienting the project were made. Throughout implementation, IDA carried out regular missions and also organized reverse monitoring missions at the Bank's office in Madagascar. Regarding procurement and financial aspects, combined supervision missions, with other Bank-funded projects, were regularly organized. The Bank was very responsive during implementation, adjusting the project activities and outcomes to the changing situation and constraints.

7.3 Overall Bank performance:

The Bank performance is rated unsatisfactory. During project implementation, the Bank education team succeeded in providing close technical assistance to the PMU. As a result, project executive directorates and MOEs in each island had strong ownership of project activities and outputs. Consequently, the low disbursement pace, observed until June 2001, improved significantly; the project could be implemented and achieved its main objectives in due time.

Borrower

7.4 Preparation:

The performance of the Borrower during preparation is assessed as unsatisfactory. Despite the fact that the Government organized a national consultation on education and prepared a Program for the Reinforcement of Education and Training, which provided the project objectives and outcomes, the PRET was overly ambitious given national capacities, and technical aspects of the program were not evaluated as well as they could have been.

7.5 Government implementation performance:

Government performance is rated unsatisfactory. Although the Government fulfilled almost all the conditions specified in the loan agreement, the Government was not able to solve key issues that affected project sustainability. The persistent political crisis prevented the Government from increasing the education budget, from resolving the back payment of teacher salaries, and from providing recurrent budgets for primary schools. The institutional instability affected the implementation of the activities related to quality and capacity building.

However, during implementation, the Government made considerable effort to appoint needed additional teachers and paid their salaries regularly. This had a significant impact on the achievement of project objectives and outcomes. A steering committee was responsible for ensuring that the project was responsive to the strategic actions for the Education Sector. This allowed for a strong ownership by the Government.

7.6 Implementing Agency:

The performance of the implementing agency is assessed as satisfactory considering that the implementation phase lasted only three years. It faced some difficulties in mobilizing itself in the first year of implementation but showed efficiency in decentralizing the management of the project to each island.

The PMU's personnel recruited were competent and responsible and had ownership of the project. However, more leadership would have resulted in better coordination and communication between the

structures of the PMU and probably would have avoided the budget overrun that occurred at the end of the project.

7.7 Overall Borrower performance:

In view of the above, the overall Borrower performance has been rated as Unsatisfactory.

8. Lessons Learned

Project design

- Community cost participation is very important, especially in countries where the Government cannot provide the population with proper social services. However, this participation must be properly assessed during the design phase of the project and constraints inherent in working with local communities must be taken into account in the project financing and scheduling.
- More details on the costs of the proposed activities have to be included in the project planning in order to ensure that the financial resources allocated correspond to the targeted results. Such planning should be undertaken during the project launch in order to adjust the results at the outset of the project.
- Where the Bank decides to support country programs, it is important to (i) validate the analytical work supporting the national program and (ii) ensure that the national capacities to implement it are potentially available.

Sector technical lessons

- In a LICUS country, Vocational Training is problematic. Despite the political pressure and the huge social demand for training, due to inefficient education system and the limited labor market, Vocational Training should be developed gradually with a prior strong commitment of an emerging productive private sector.
- Setting up a demand-driven vocational training system in an unstructured economy is not easy and requires prior appropriate knowledge and an analysis of the market labor force and the private sector.
- Addressing quality issues requires prior national consensus on standards in curricula and the evaluation system. These conditions were missing in the Comorian context, thus slowing down the impact of actions on teacher training.

Operational matters

- In a changing institutional context with weak national capacity, it is advisable that the PMU have capacity to support the Ministry in project monitoring and evaluation. An independent PMU is key to avoiding political interference in project implementation.
- By decentralizing project management/implementation, the project avoided interference with its implementation. A comprehensive plan of activities was prepared and agreed upon at the beginning of project implementation. This allowed for a better understanding by all stakeholders and solidified their commitment to project implementation, regardless of the institutional changes.
- Where project management/implementation is decentralized and the national capacity is low, close

attention should be paid to the coordination and communication between the PMU and its decentralized units. Particularly, comprehensive procedures and responsibilities on reporting should be set up from the beginning.

9. Partner Comments

(a) Borrower/implementing agency:

(b) Cofinanciers:

(c) Other partners (NGOs/private sector):

10. Additional Information

Annex 1. Key Performance Indicators/Log Frame Matrix

Outcome / Impact Indicators:

Indicator/Matrix	Projected in last PSR ¹	Actual/Latest Estimate
1. Increase in new intakes in Grade 1.	AR = 95%	AR=90%
2. Reduction in the gap between the enrollment ratios in school districts.	NER in Domoni (68%) and Nyumakele (62%)	GER in Comoros (101%), Moheli (118%), Anjouan (81%), Grande Comore (100%)
3. Increase in the number of girls entering Grade 1.	1:1	Gender parity index in Comoros 0.85
4. Reduction in the repetition rates (RR) at all levels.	18%	Grande Comore 26%, Moheli 29%, Anjouan 27%
5. One-hundred and sixty class days per school year, including examinations.	180	180
6. Increase in the number of graduates finding employment within 6 months after graduation	80%	NA
7. Improvement in the productivity and salary progression of beneficiaries of training.	Salary progression measured	NA the tracking survey was not undertaken for all the sub-projects
8. Comparison of economic cost (total and per diem) between various training schemes.	Comparisons available	NA
9. Regular payment of civil servant's salaries. Cumulative number of months of arrears for salaries	Arrears liquidation. Timely payments	During project implementation, teachers were paid regularly. However, there are still 19 months of arrears for the previous years
10. An increasing share of the MOE budget is allocated to non-salary recurrent expenditure for priority action programs.	Revised to 10%	Due to institutional crisis, since 2001, official budget was not set up in Comoros
11. Increase in % of Primary Ed to total Ed budget	Revised : At least 60% Education Budget spent on primary education	Due to institutional crisis, since 2001, official budget was not set up in Comoros

Output Indicators:

Indicator/Matrix	Projected in last PSR ¹	Actual/Latest Estimate

¹ End of project

Annex 2. Project Costs and Financing

Project Cost by Component (in US\$ million equivalent)

Component	Appraisal Estimate US\$ million	Actual/Latest Estimate US\$ million	Percentage of Appraisal
Civil Works	2.30	2.46	107
Equipment and vehicles	1.00	0.87	87
Textbooks and instructional Materials	0.65	0.93	143
Consultants services Training, Audit			
Part A and C	0.54	0.52	95
Part B	0.11	0.25	229
Training Grants	0.40	0.44	111
Operating Costs			
Part A and C	0.44	0.67	152
Part B	0.36	0.17	48
PPF	0.71	0.46	65
Unallocated	0.49	0.00	
Total Baseline Cost	7.00	6.77	
Total Project Costs	7.00	6.77	
Total Financing Required	7.00	6.77	

Project Costs by Procurement Arrangements (Appraisal Estimate) (US\$ million equivalent)

Expenditure Category	Procurement Method ¹			N.B.F.	Total Cost
	ICB	NCB	Other ²		
1. Works	0.00 (0.00)	0.09 (0.09)	2.67 (2.34)	0.00 (0.00)	2.76 (2.43)
2. Goods	1.00 (1.00)	0.60 (0.55)	0.20 (0.18)	0.00 (0.00)	1.80 (1.73)
3. Services	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.70 (0.70)	0.00 (0.00)	0.70 (0.70)
4. Training grants	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.40 (0.40)	0.00 (0.00)	0.40 (0.40)
5. Operating Costs	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	1.16 (1.04)	0.00 (0.00)	1.16 (1.04)
6. PPF	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.71 (0.71)	0.00 (0.00)	0.71 (0.71)
Total	1.00 (1.00)	0.69 (0.64)	5.84 (5.37)	0.00 (0.00)	7.53 (7.01)

Project Costs by Procurement Arrangements (Actual/Latest Estimate) (US\$ million equivalent)

Expenditure Category	Procurement Method ¹			N.B.F.	Total Cost
	ICB	NCB	Other ²		
1. Works	0.00 (0.00)	1.34 (1.34)	1.12 (1.12)	0.00 (0.00)	2.46 (2.46)
2. Goods	1.19 (1.19)	0.39 (0.39)	0.23 (0.23)	0.00 (0.00)	1.81 (1.81)
3. Services	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.76 (0.76)	0.00 (0.00)	0.76 (0.76)
4. Training grants	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.44 (0.44)	0.00 (0.00)	0.44 (0.44)
5. Operating Costs	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.84 (0.84)	0.00 (0.00)	0.84 (0.84)
6. PPF	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.47 (0.47)	0.00 (0.00)	0.47 (0.47)
Total	1.19 (1.19)	1.73 (1.73)	3.86 (3.86)	0.00 (0.00)	6.78 (6.78)

^{1/} Figures in parenthesis are the amounts to be financed by the Bank Loan. All costs include contingencies.

^{2/} Includes civil works and goods to be procured through national shopping, consulting services, services of contracted staff of the project management office, training, technical assistance services, and incremental operating costs related to (i) managing the project, and (ii) re-lending project funds to local government units.

Annex 3. Economic Costs and Benefits

Not Applicable

Annex 4. Bank Inputs

(a) Missions:

Stage of Project Cycle	No. of Persons and Specialty (e.g. 2 Economists, 1 FMS, etc.)		Performance Rating		
	Month/Year	Count	Specialty	Implementation Progress	Development Objective
Identification/Preparation					
	April/1992	2	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); TEXTBOOK SPECIALIST (1)		
	December/1996	2	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); TEXTBOOK SPECIALIST (1)		
Appraisal/Negotiation					
	February/1997	5	LEAD EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1) ; ECONOMIC ANALYST (1); CONSULTANTS (2)		
	March/1997	3	LEAD EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); LEGAL (1)		
Supervision					
	July/1998	1	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1)	U	U
	October/1998	1	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1)	U	U
	March/2000	2	MISSION LEADER (1); IMPLEMENTATION SPECIALIST (1)	S	S
	February/2001	2	LEAD EDUCATION SPECIAL (1) ; PROCUREMENT SPECIALIST (1)	S	S
	October/2001	3	LEAD EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); PROCUREMENT SPECIALIST (1); FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND AUDIT (1)	S	S
	May/2002	4	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND AUDIT (1); PROCUREMENT SPECIALIST (1); DISBURSEMENT (1)	S	S
	December/2002	3	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); PROGRAM ASSISTANT (1); PROCUREMENT SPECIALIST (1)	S	S
	June/2003	3	LEAD ED SP/TTL (1); EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); PROGRAM ASSISTANT (1)	S	S
	October/2003	3	EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); LEAD EDUCATION SPECIAL	S	S

ICR	January/2004	2	(1); PROGRAM ASSISTANT (1)	
			EDUCATION SPECIALIST (1); CONSULTANT (1)	

(b) Staff:

Stage of Project Cycle	Actual/Latest Estimate	
	No. Staff weeks	US\$ ('000)
Identification/Preparation		324,000
Appraisal/Negotiation		108,000
Supervision		271,000
ICR		25,000
Total		728,000

Annex 5. Ratings for Achievement of Objectives/Outputs of Components

(H=High, SU=Substantial, M=Modest, N=Negligible, NA=Not Applicable)

	<u>Rating</u>				
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Macro policies</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input checked="" type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Sector Policies</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input checked="" type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Physical</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input checked="" type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Financial</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input checked="" type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Institutional Development</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input checked="" type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Environmental</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input checked="" type="radio"/> NA
 <i>Social</i>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Poverty Reduction</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input checked="" type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Gender</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input checked="" type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input type="checkbox"/> <i>Other (Please specify)</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Private sector development</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input checked="" type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Public sector management</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input checked="" type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA
<input type="checkbox"/> <i>Other (Please specify)</i>	<input type="radio"/> H	<input type="radio"/> SU	<input type="radio"/> M	<input type="radio"/> N	<input type="radio"/> NA

Annex 6. Ratings of Bank and Borrower Performance

(HS=Highly Satisfactory, S=Satisfactory, U=Unsatisfactory, HU=Highly Unsatisfactory)

6.1 Bank performance

Rating

- | | | | | |
|---|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Lending | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input type="checkbox"/> S | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Supervision | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> S | <input type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Overall | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> S | <input type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |

6.2 Borrower performance

Rating

- | | | | | |
|---|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Preparation | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input type="checkbox"/> S | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Government implementation performance | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input type="checkbox"/> S | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Implementation agency performance | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> S | <input type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Overall | <input type="checkbox"/> HS | <input type="checkbox"/> S | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> U | <input type="checkbox"/> HU |

Annex 7. List of Supporting Documents

1. Staff Appraisal Report No. 16375-COM, dated June 5, 1997.
2. Interim Fund Development Credit Agreement, dated October 24, 1997.
3. Borrower's Evaluation Report, dated April 03, 2004.
4. Project Status Reports, sequences 01-16, dated February 9, 1998 to May 4, 2004.
5. Aide-memoire of the supervision/completion mission, dated January 4-10, 2004.
6. Document de Stratégie de Croissance et de Réduction de la Pauvreté, document intérimaire, dated June 2003.
7. Transitional Support Strategy for the Union of Comoros, dated August 2003

Additional Annex 8. Borrower's Final Project Evaluation

RAPPORT D'ACHEVEMENT DU GOUVERNEMENT

I/ Introduction

Dans le cadre du Plan Directeur de l'Education, le gouvernement comorien a négocié le financement de certaines activités jugées prioritaires par les parties qui l'ont élaboré au cours des états généraux de 1994, notamment : l'amélioration de la qualité de l'enseignement primaire, la participation des communautés locales à l'éducation et l'amélioration de la main d'œuvre qualifiée ; ce choix prend en compte les analyses économiques institutionnelles et politiques. Il convient de préciser que les Comores vivaient en 1997, période de la négociation du Projet Education III, une situation politique tourmentée marquée par une crise séparatiste née de la sécession de l'île de Ndzuani.

A l'époque, les principales activités retenues prioritaires pour bénéficier de financement sont la composante de l'enseignement primaire et participation communautaire, et celle de la formation Professionnelle et technique, dans une gestion efficace du projet.

Six années après la signature de l'accord de crédit N° - 031- COM intervenu le 24 octobre 1997, pour un montant de 5 100 000 DTS équivalent à 3 606 720 000 KMF, 3 ans et 6 mois après sa mise en vigueur le 23 juin 2000, à la date du 31 décembre 2003, le projet éducation est exécuté à hauteur de 98% dans toutes ses composantes. Rappelons que la mise en vigueur était conditionnée, lors de la revue conjointe du portefeuille des projets du 06 au 11 mars 2000, par :

- la transmission des originaux des avis juridiques
- le dépôt des fonds de contre - partie, et
- la mise en place d'un système de gestion comptable et financière du Projet.

Le tout assorti de la réconciliation nationale, de mesures de réformes, d'une amorce de bonne gouvernance pour la stabilité et la croissance économique, avec le paiement des arriérés dus au titre des crédits de l'IDA à régler avant le 31 décembre 1999.

II/ Objectifs et réalisations du crédit du Projet Education III

Le Projet Education III est destiné à appuyer les investissements dans les deux premiers sous-secteurs prioritaires identifiés dans le Plan Directeur, à savoir l'enseignement primaire et la formation professionnelle, avec renforcement des capacités locales en matière de planification, d'exécution, de suivi et d'évaluation des activités financées dans le cadre du Projet.

II.1/ Premier objectif : améliorer la qualité de l'enseignement primaire.
(coût estimé à 4.5 millions de dollars, soit 65% du coût du PEIII)

Dans le cadre de l'assimilation des connaissances au niveau primaire, le Projet a appuyé les réalisations ci-dessous :

(a) pour la participation des parents, des élèves et des enseignants :

Création de plus de 70% de conseils d'écoles sur l'étendue du territoire national (le pourcentage complémentaire étant pris en compte par d'autres bailleurs). Cette mise en place de conseils d'école a été suivie par une formation initiale sur les rôles des membres et le fonctionnement des conseils.

Fourniture de 148 salles de classe réparties dans 84 écoles. En effet, le Projet a permis à 31% des écoles primaires publiques de disposer de salles de classe supplémentaires équipées en mobiliers scolaires, latrines et bureaux de directeurs ;

(b) pour la qualité du processus éducatif :

263110 manuels scolaires sont distribués dans les établissements à raison d'un livre par élève. Ils sont livrés et repartis comme suit :

Mwali : 17429
Ndzuanani : 115783
Ngazidja : 129898

24 nouvelles écoles primaires publiques viennent d'être recensées (08 à Ngazidja, 15 à Ndzuanani et 1 à Mwali). Faute de crédit disponible, le Projet n'a pas été en mesure de programmer une nouvelle commande. De même qu'il n'a pas pu acquérir les guides pour les maîtres en sciences. Il est également à souligner qu'il n'a pas été possible de réaliser la formation des maîtres sur l'utilisation de ces nouveaux manuels en Ngazidja comme à Ndzuanani, même si des améliorations sont observées au niveau des résultats scolaires.

Pour les enseignants, le Projet a fourni, outre les 1800 cartables distribués aux enseignants ayant le plus d'années de service dans l'ensemble des écoles du pays, 2362 livres de français et 2337 de mathématiques ; soit au total 4699 guides de maître. Le tout représente un capital de manuels pédagogiques de 266 971 livres à gérer par les conseils d'école.

Dans ce même processus, le Projet a fourni à chaque école primaire publique un lot de kits pédagogiques composé d'un dictionnaire, d'une carte géographique des Comores, d'une carte géographique Afrique, d'une balance Roberval (pm) avec différents poids, d'un planisphère et d'un décimètre.

Pour assurer le bon déroulement des rentrées scolaires 2001-2002 et 2002-2003, le Projet a financé la dotation de fournitures scolaires et équipements sportifs pour toutes les écoles primaires publiques du pays.

- La formation des encadreurs pédagogiques : Dans le cadre des changements des pratiques de supervision pour permettre à un encadrement et un suivi efficace, 15 inspecteurs de l'enseignement primaire et 29 conseillers pédagogiques ont été formés pendant deux ans et respectivement à l'INFP de Mahamasina à Antananarivo et dans les IFERE de Patsy (Anjouan) et de Moroni (Ngazidja). Ces encadreurs sont opérationnels, en poste depuis la rentrée scolaire 2003/2004.

- Les inspections pédagogiques : les encadreurs nouvellement en poste, vont bénéficier des matériels roulants et informatiques mis à la disposition de leurs prédécesseurs dans les inspections et Circonscriptions d'Inspection Pédagogiques Régionales des îles pour l'exercice de leurs

fonctions.

- La formation continue des enseignants : pour l'amélioration de **la qualité** de l'enseignement, le Projet Education III a financé les services d'un consultant pédagogue pour les concertations dans des regroupements dans les îles. Quatre stages ont été retenus.

Stage 1 : concerne 771 enseignants nouvellement recrutés et / ou non qualifiés.

Stage 2 : concerne les 2383 enseignants sur l'utilisation des nouveaux manuels.

Stage 3 : s'adresse aux 293 directeurs d'écoles et adjoints, sur l'acquisition des compétences sur les rôles pédagogique, administratif et social d'un gestionnaire d'établissement scolaire.

Stage 4 : 1152 membres de conseils d'écoles sont concernés pour la communautarisation efficace des établissements primaires, la contribution de la communauté à l'accès à une éducation de qualité avec un accent particulier sur l'approche genre et sur la gestion efficiente de l'école.

II .2/ Deuxième objectif : Améliorer la formation des travailleurs qualifiés.

Dans le domaine de la Formation Technique et Professionnelle ,le Projet Education III visait dans sa composante B à améliorer la qualité da la main d'œuvre , grâce à la mise en place d'un système de formation , induit par la demande , autonome , souple et efficace basé sur le partenariat et le cofinancement (le coût de cette composante est estimé à 1,0Millions US\$ soit 14% du coût total du Projet).

Il s'agit de : (i) la création d'une structure autonome qui sera géré par un Conseil d'Administration indépendant ; (ii) la préparation et la réalisation de sous-projets de formation répondant à des besoins identifiés sur le marché du travail ; (iii) la création d'un Fonds d'Appui à la Formation (FAF) et la mise en place de mécanismes de financement pour alimenter ce Fonds avec l'implication et la participation de l'Etat et du secteur privé ; (iv) l'appui aux établissements de formation pour les rendre plus autonomes et renforcer les compétences dans les domaines de la gestion et la préparation de programmes modulaires adaptés aux besoins du marché de travail.

Les réalisations

Pour atteindre cet objectif, les activités ont été identifiées pour être exécutées pendant la durée du Projet : (i) établissement d'un système de formation performant par la création de l'Office de la Formation Technique et Professionnelle (OFTP) , structure autonome chargée de la mise en place du nouveau système de formation ; (ii) information et sensibilisation des différents partenaires (Etat , promoteurs économiques communautés villageoise , ONG groupements de producteurs ...) ; (iii) mise en place du FAF ; (iv) réalisation de sous-projets de formation ; (v) réalisation d'études de préparation et d'évaluation des sous-projets de formation ; (vi) appui aux établissements de formation par la formation des formateurs.

1) Etablissement du nouveau système de formation : Le nouveau système de formation a été mis en place conformément aux objectifs fixés dans le Projet Education III approuvés par le l'Emprunteur et le Bailleur de Fonds. La loi N° 97-002/AF du 06 juin 1997 et le décret N°97-008/PM du 31 juillet 1997 ont instauré un cadre juridique et institutionnel de l'OFTP et fixé les missions de ce dernier.

Conformément à la loi de création et aux statuts de l'OFTP, les organes de l'Office ont été mis en place en 1998 pour le Conseil d'Administration et en 2000 pour la Direction. Il est à souligner que l'OFTP bénéficie d'une autonomie administrative et financière étant donné la composition de son Conseil d'Administration (où l'Etat ne dispose que de 4 sièges sur 11) et le rôle joué par ce dernier dans la programmation des activités et la prise des différentes décisions.

Comme prévu dans l'Accord de Crédit le Projet a financé les équipements et matériels nécessaires, ainsi que le fonctionnement de l'OFTP. Quant au personnel, son effectif a été considérablement réduit par rapport au Projet initial, en vue de renforcer les Directions Exécutives Régionales (DER) qui ont été créées dans les 3 îles. L'OFTP s'appuyait sur les DERs pour la réalisation des activités à Anjouan et à Mohéli. Pendant ces trois années d'activité du Projet, l'OFTP a initié le système de formation induit par la demande, basé sur le partenariat et le cofinancement, et les résultats enregistrés seront présentés dans les parties qui suivent.

2) Information et sensibilisation des partenaires : cette nouvelle approche dans la formation professionnelle avait besoin pour réussir du soutien de tous les partenaires, d'où l'importance accordée aux activités d'information et de sensibilisation. La Direction de l'OFTP a organisé, avec l'appui des DER et des membres du Conseil d'Administration des réunions dans les différentes régions du pays pour présenter à tous les acteurs de l'Economie nationale le nouveau système de formation et leur expliquer les procédures et les conditions requises pour bénéficier des formations. Le principal résultat enregistré est la forte adhésion de la population qui a accepté l'idée que chacun doit participer au financement de sa propre formation à en juger par le nombre de demandes de formation qui continue à arriver à la Direction de l'OFTP.

3) Mise en place du FAF : Pour financer les sous-projets de formation (préparation, réalisation suivi et évaluation), l'OFTP dispose d'un Fonds d'Appui à la Formation (FAF) qui a été alimenté par les crédits du Projet. La Direction de l'Office a élaboré un manuel de gestion qui fixe les conditions d'éligibilité à ce fonds, les procédures de montage d'un dossier de sous-projet ainsi que les procédures d'exécution de suivi et d'évaluation. Le Projet prévoyait qu'à la fin du Projet, le FAF sera alimenté à 100% par la contribution des entreprises et des organisations professionnelles. Mais la conjoncture économique n'a pas permis d'atteindre cet objectif. Bien sûr, la part versée par l'OFTP dans le financement des sous-projets de formation est allée en diminuant pour passer de près de 90% en 2000 à moins de 70% en 2003 alors que la contribution du bénéficiaire est passée de 10 à 22% pendant la même période. Ça montre que cette prise en charge doit être progressive et programmée à moyen terme. L'OFTP a fait réaliser à la fin de l'année 2003 une étude sur ce financement. Dans les recommandations, l'étude propose les mécanismes à mettre en place en vue de mobiliser des fonds pour alimenter le FAF avec la contribution de tous les partenaires. Les autorités comoriennes vont, après concertation avec toutes les parties concernées, prendre les dispositions et mesures nécessaires pour la mise en œuvre et le suivi de ces recommandations et assurer ainsi la pérennisation des activités de l'OFTP.

4) Réalisation des sous-projets de formation : Le travail de préparation et réalisation des sous-projets de formation a eu un démarrage difficile pour ensuite connaître dès le deuxième semestre 2001 une accélération qui n'a cessé d'augmenter jusqu'à la fin de l'année 2003. Le Projet a permis de réaliser plus de 130 sous-projet et former plus de 43300 personnes. Ces chiffres montrent

que dans ce domaine l'objectif fixé dans les documents du Projet est largement dépassé puisqu'on prévoyait la réalisation de 52 sous-projets et la formation de 800 personnes.

Le Projet a contribué à l'amélioration de la qualité de la main d'œuvre et à l'insertion professionnelle des jeunes et fourni un appui aux petits producteurs et aux petits artisans. En effet sur l'ensemble des trois îles:

- (i) plus de 300 pêcheurs ont été formés sur les techniques de pêche, la sécurité en mer et la mécanique HB et sont capables d'assurer les petits entretiens de leur embarcation et de leurs moteurs
- (ii) plus de 350 producteurs maraîchers ont suivi des formations sur les techniques de fertilisation des terres et autres techniques de production comme la production en contre saison en vue d'améliorer la qualité et le rendement dans des domaines qui étaient jusqu'ici mal maîtrisés comme la production de l'oignon ou de la pomme de terre
- (iii) des dizaines de personnes ont bénéficié de formation en poterie, en broderie et en vannerie et vont devenir des animateurs ou des fournisseurs pour la Maison de l'Artisanat qui va ouvrir à Anjouan avec l'appui du Projet PDLC de la Coopération Française
- (iv) une centaine de jeunes anciens miliciens ont été formés à Anjouan et vont grâce à l'appui financier du Projet AMIE , des SANDOUK, des MECK et d'autres organisations , s'installer dans des secteurs comme la pêche , l'aviculture , la réparation automobile ;
- (v) plus d'une centaine de personnes (dont 70% de femme) composées de petits commerçants de vendeuses du marché, de petits artisans menuisiers, les petits maçons et de couturières ont reçu une formation d'alphabétisation fonctionnelle qui leur a permis, chacun dans son secteur, de connaître les outils de base de gestion et avoir une bonne maîtrise.

5) L'évaluation des besoins : Cette fonction n'a pas été réalisée pendant la période du Projet dans le sens d'un suivi régulier de l'évolution du marché du travail, l'OFTP ne disposant pas d'assez de moyen pour la réalisation d'une telle mission. Toutefois, l'Office prend toutes les dispositions pour vérifier l'état des besoins à chaque fois qu'une demande de formation lui est adressée. Cette évaluation des besoins est réalisée soit par les services de l'OFTP sous forme d'enquête auprès des candidats à la formation soit sous forme d'une étude confiée à un consultant.

Par rapport au suivi régulier de l'évolution du marché en terme de besoins de formation, l'Office a initié un projet de création d'un Observatoire de l'Emploi et des Formations. Ce Projet qui bénéficie de l'appui du PRIMTAF de la Coopération Canadienne dans sa première phase, sera réalisé en partenariat avec la Direction de l'Emploi, le Commissariat Général au Plan (le Service des Statistiques) et l'UCCIA.

6) Appui aux établissements de formation : Cet appui a essentiellement porté sur le développement professionnel du personnel en poste dans ces établissements en vue d'améliorer leurs compétences et leur permettre de développer de nouveaux produits et de nouveaux programmes

dans l'objectif de renforcer l'autonomie dont bénéficie ces établissements. Suivant l'Accord de Crédit et les aides - mémoires de différentes missions de supervision du Projet, une étude sur ces établissements a été réalisée pour faire l'état des lieux et évaluer les besoins. Il a été recommandé dans cette étude d'orienter les formations dans les directions suivantes : (i) amélioration des compétences techniques des formateurs ; (ii) la méthodologie et l'élaboration des programmes ; (iii) l'organisation et la gestion des établissements de formation.

C'est ainsi que l'Office a financé des formations de perfectionnement technique en faveur de 10 formateurs (2 de l'ENTP, 2 du CNH et 6 de l'ENAC) et une formation en gestion en faveur du Directeur de l'ENAC. D'autres formations ont été programmées pour l'année 2003 mais n'ont pas pu être réalisées à cause d'un manque de crédit. Il s'agit : d'une formation de perfectionnement technique en faveur de trois formateurs de l'ENTP ; (ii) une formation (pédagogique) sur l'approche par compétence en faveur d'un groupe de formateurs sélectionnés dans tous les établissements de formation ; et (iii) une formation sur la gestion des établissements de formation.

7) Suivi et évaluation : Des mécanismes ont été mis en place par l'OFTP pour assurer un suivi régulier des sous-projets de formation et un suivi des personnes formées.

a) le suivi des sous-projets de formation : C'est un suivi pendant la formation qui était réalisé sous forme de visites effectuées (pour chaque sous-projet) par la Direction de l'OFTP ou la DER. Pendant ces visites, l'équipe de l'OFTP évaluait l'état d'avancement de l'activité, s'assurait du respect des termes du contrat par chacune des parties engagées et recueillait leurs avis et remarques sur l'organisation et la réalisation de la formation. Ces visites de suivi ont dans certains cas conduit à des révisions des programmes de formation, des réaménagements des emplois du temps des amendements ou des suspensions des contrats.

b) le suivi des personnes formées : Ce suivi était organisé sous forme d'étude d'évaluation d'impact portant sur un échantillon de sous-projets achevés depuis au moins 6 mois. C'est ainsi que nous avons recruté des consultants indépendants pour réaliser des études d'évaluation de l'impact des certains sous-projets de formation exécutés entre 2000 et 2002. Les études ont porté sur total de 15 sous-projets (soit plus de 10% des sous-projets réalisés) choisis dans différents secteurs et sur l'ensemble des 3 îles. Les informations demandées à travers ces études portaient sur :

1. l'impact sur la personne formée : la maîtrise des techniques enseignées, leur utilisation, l'amélioration des compétences, l'impact sur les revenus ...
2. l'avis des personnes formées sur ce système de formation initié par l'OFTP, basé sur le partenariat et le cofinancement
3. l'impact sur le rendement professionnel : la vitesse d'exécution des tâches, la qualité du service, l'augmentation des commandes et de la clientèle ...
4. appréciation et avis de la population et des clients bénéficiaires (ou consommateurs) des services fournis par la personne formée

D'une manière générale, on peut dire que l'impact est positif dans la mesure où : (i) plus de 80% des personnes formées travaillent (soit à leur propre compte soit chez un employeur) ; (ii) la grande majorité des personnes interrogées sont satisfaites et trouvent que la formation a répondu à leur attente ; (iii) toutes les personnes interrogées souhaiteraient suivre d'autres formations avec l'OFTP et sont prêtes à participer au financement de la formation en payant une partie des frais de leur propre formation.

II. 3/ Assurer une gestion efficace du PROJET

(coût estimé à 0.8millions US \$, soit 11% du coût du Projet)

En 1994, le Ministère de l'Education a créé une unité centrale pour coordonner tous les projets dans le secteur de l'éducation : le Centre National de la Gestion et de l'Exécution des projets d'éducation (CNGEPE). Cette unité a été chargée de la mise en œuvre du deuxième Projet d'Education, intégrant ainsi le personnel du Bureau d'Exécution du Projet Education (BEPE) qui avait été créé pour coordonner l'exécution du Deuxième Projet Education qui a pris une grande part dans la préparation du Plan Directeur de l'Education. En consultation avec les bailleurs de fonds, le Ministère de l'Education a décidé de créer, le cas échéant, des unités séparées pour l'exécution des projets qui seront chargées de superviser les activités financées par le projet et de gérer les opérations au jour le jour.

Voilà pourquoi est créée la Cellule de Gestion du Projet Education (CGPE) pour assurer la liaison avec le CNGEPE de manière à coordonner efficacement les activités dans le cadre du Plan Directeur. Seulement le CNGEPE est dissout quelques temps avant l'installation de la CGPE dont le coordonnateur général supervise le Projet Education avec la collaboration du Directeur de l'Office de Formation Technique et Professionnelle (OFTP).

Les structures du Projet

Le Projet a appuyé la création de la CGPE. Il a également financé la remise en état des locaux destinés à abriter la CGPE et l'OFTP. Il faut préciser que l'installation des structures du Projet a commencé au 4ème trimestre de l'année 1998 dans le building du Ministère de l'Education Nationale de l'époque, et s'est achevée en avril 2001. Tout le personnel du projet a été recruté et a pris son service, notamment celui des Directions Exécutives Régionales (DERs) des îles. Ces DERs non prévues dans les négociations du projet ont été créées suite à la forte demande de décentralisation au cours des négociations de la réconciliation nationale.

Le personnel du projet a suivi les formations dans les domaines qui suivent : (i) la gestion comptable et financière, (ii) la gestion des projets, (iii) la passation des marchés, (iv) l'utilisation de l'outil informatique.

Un système de gestion a été mis en place pour faciliter le travail de gestion quotidienne du Projet, même si ce système s'est avéré défaillant.

Le développement institutionnel

A ce niveau, le Projet a fourni des moyens nécessaires pour accompagner les services de planification, des statistiques et de cartes scolaires pour la mise en place de banques de données et la production des tableaux de bords sur l'Education. Il a aussi contribué à la formation des cadres des services centraux et régionaux des Ministères en charge de l'Education, permettant ainsi la reprise de la production des tableaux de bords par île en 2002/2003.

Elaboration du Plan National d'Actions de l'Education Pour Tous (PNA/EPT)

Le Projet a financé les consultations et les activités pour la réalisation du PNA/EPT et certaines contributions à l'élaboration de la Note Sectorielle de l'Education.

Situation financière et passation des marchés

Sur le plan de la tenue des comptes, le Projet Education est confronté à une difficulté au niveau de la comptabilité. Les seuils des comptes spéciaux 350,000 US\$ pour le compte A et 150,000 US\$ pour le compte B ont marqué l'exécution du Projet dans la mesure où ils se sont démontrés très insuffisants pour faire face aux activités programmées au cours des années. Le rehaussement du seuil du compte spécial A de 350,000\$ US à 500,000\$ US en juin 2002 a permis au Projet d'accélérer ses activités pour atteindre 98% des décaissements prévus fin 2003.

Rappelons que les seuils de 350,000 US\$ du compte A et 150,000 US\$ du compte B ont été calculés sur la base de 5 ans de décaissement sur les 5,100,000 DTS, or les gestionnaires du Projet étaient contraints par l'accord de crédit d'exécuter le Projet en deux ans et après amendement en 3 ans. Des factures restent en instance au 31 décembre 2003, ce qui entraîne le non-paiement des services rendus par des fournisseurs.

L'issue de la séance de travail de la Commission de Vérification des Comptes (unité sous l'autorité de la Présidence de la République) qui a débuté le 04 février 2004, permettra à l'Emprunteur et à l'Administrateur des crédits du Troisième Projet Education d'envisager la suite urgente à donner aux factures en instance.

III / Appréciations critiques

Le Projet Education est le plus grand intervenant dans le domaine de l'Education. Les autorités comoriennes considèrent unanimement que ce Projet Education III est important, utile. Il bénéficie ainsi de leur appui et de leurs bonnes dispositions, même si elles estiment que le Projet est quelque peu dépassé à cause du retard de 3 ans de son démarrage et de son intervention unique dans le seul niveau primaire.

Les actions financées par le Projet Education sont identifiées et demandées par les différents Ministères de l'éducation et celui des Affaires Sociales, (à travers les inspecteurs, les directeurs techniques, y compris les activités dont bénéficient les gestionnaires du Projet) qui avalisent les requêtes des collectivités locales qui formulent souvent des demandes de construction des salles de classe. Toutes les autres activités sont identifiées par les techniciens ou par les groupements

coopératifs pour le cas des sous - projets de formation. La responsabilité technique de chaque action incombe au demandeur. Les Ministères ne sont pas toujours en mesure de suivre les activités du Projet ; ils ne disposent pas des moyens à la hauteur des mouvements de celui-ci, qui semble être un état dans un état (allusion à l'appui institutionnel demandé par l'ancien Ministère de l'Education pour permettre à l'institution de suivre les activités du Projet).

Des difficultés de crédits ont été observées dès le démarrage du projet à cause du seuil trop bas de décaissement. Il a été constaté aussi le rythme lent des décaissements (environ 2 mois d'attente entre la date d'envoi de la DRF et l'approvisionnement du compte spécial du montant demandé) Sur le cas précis, nous saluons la disponibilité de l'équipe de la Banque Mondiale à accompagner les autorités comoriennes et les gestionnaires du Projet dans la recherche des solutions. 04(quatre) amendements ont été nécessaires pour adapter les procédures aux exigences de la population dans les nouvelles institutions politiques mises en place.

Dans la composante A

Suivant les données disponibles, le Projet a contribué positivement au développement du système éducatif, grâce à une amélioration de la situation avec un taux brut d'admission de 97% en 2002/2003 sur le territoire national. L'augmentation du taux d'admission en CPI dans cette période du Projet, est de 91%. Le Projet a également contribué à redonner du crédit à l'enseignement primaire public en accord avec les autorités éducatives qui ont maintenu la régularité des salaires durant l'exécution du projet, évitant ainsi le spectre de la grève des enseignants. Cependant, dans le cadre des formations des enseignants et membres des conseils d'écoles, des formations, entamées ou non, restent à réaliser, particulièrement celle relative à l'utilisation des manuels scolaires. Un constat de manque de crédit a interrompu toute suite à donner à presque toutes les activités du quatrième trimestre 2003.

Dans la composante B

La mise en œuvre de l'OFTP et de ses activités ne s'est pas effectuée sans difficultés. Mais malgré ces difficultés, on peut dire que l'Office a assuré les missions qui lui ont été fixées dans l'accord de crédit et dans les textes réglementaires et les objectifs principaux ont été réalisés à plus de 90% et même dépassés dans certains cas.

a) les principaux résultats : Le Projet a apporté son appui pour développer dans le pays une culture de partenariat dans l'organisation, la gestion et le financement de la formation professionnelle. Et les principaux résultats à retenir après ces trois années d'activité du Projet sont les suivants : (i) l'OFTP, promoteur de ce nouveau système est bien opérationnel sur l'ensemble du territoire national et il est doté de moyens matériels, pédagogiques et humains qui lui permettront, s'ils sont maintenus de poursuivre les activités après le Projet ; (ii) l'OFTP a réussi en moins de trois ans à sensibiliser et mobiliser les partenaires, et mettre en place le nouveau système de formation ; (iii) système de formation qui s'est avéré souple, adapté et capable de répondre rapidement et efficacement aux besoins exprimés par les promoteurs économiques ; (iv) toutes les formations ont été réalisées en partenariat avec les bénéficiaires; (v) l'image de la Formation Professionnelle a été valorisée auprès d'une grande partie de la population active qui a désormais compris que la connaissance et la

maîtrise des techniques du métier qu'on exerce (ou qu'on veut exercer) est l'un des facteurs de réussite ;

b) les points faibles : Un certain nombre de points risque de fragiliser le système s'ils ne sont pas rapidement résolus. Il s'agit de :

i) La mise en place des mécanismes de financement de la formation : le Projet s'est achevé avant que l'OFTP et ses partenaires aient pu mettre en place ces nouveaux mécanismes. En effet, avant de définir et arrêter les nouveaux mécanismes de financement, il a fallu sensibiliser et mobiliser les partenaires et obtenir leur adhésion au nouveau système pour ensuite réaliser une étude sur le financement dont les recommandations devraient présenter les différentes options possibles et présenter un plan de mise en œuvre. A cause de la mise en œuvre tardive du Projet Education III, cette étude n'a pu être réalisée qu'au 4^e trimestre 2003 et le rapport a été remis à la fin du mois de décembre 2003.

ii) La réduction du personnel : L'OFTP a fonctionné avec un personnel réduit de plus de 50% par rapport aux effectifs prévu dans les documents du Projet. C'est en s'appuyant sur le personnel en poste dans les Direction Exécutive Régionales du Projet que les différentes activités ont pu être réalisées. Avec la fin du Projet et la fermeture de ces DER, l'Office aura besoin d'un renforcement de ses effectifs pour faire face aux demandes de formation qui lui sont adressées.

Dans la composante C

20 % du personnel initialement prévu n'a pas été obtenu. La formation très tardive du personnel en poste a marqué les réalisations par quelques incohérences marquées par des retards et /ou par des erreurs.

La leçon à tirer est celle qui devra guiderait à confirmer les compétences des techniciens nouvellement rentrés de leurs pérégrinations. Une mise en condition et une harmonisation des connaissances du pays et de ses réalités doit s'ajouter aux connaissances techniques ramenées par le technicien à recruter.

Un suivi-évaluation annuel de la gestion du Projet par le Ministère de tutelle est nécessaire. A défaut, une prise en compte assidue du rapport trimestriel du gestionnaire du projet serait bénéfique pour tous.

Le grand esprit d'accompagnement et de compréhension manifesté par la Banque tout au long de l'exécution du Projet est à saluer avec reconnaissance. Au cours du Projet, il y a eu (4) amendements de l'accord de crédit N° 031-COM, et la Banque a su accompagner le Gouvernement comorien dans la recherche de solution pour la satisfaction de la population du pays.

La conditionnalité de la contre - partie du Gouvernement, parce que celui-ci l'a demandé au bailleur de fonds de le minimiser pour permettre au Projet sa mise en vigueur immédiate pour le bien de la population des Comores.

Conclusion

Nous estimons que le PROJET EDUCATION III a atteint ses objectifs fixés d'*améliorer l'enseignement primaire* par la sensibilisation sur la *participation communautaire* et la mise en place *des conseils d'écoles* ; par *l'amélioration de l'infrastructure* et l'amélioration qualitative de *l'éducation* grâce aux formations et l'installation des encadreurs pédagogiques après la distribution des outils pédagogiques cités plus haut.

La mise en place *d'un système de formation professionnelle* avec *l'adhésion de tous les partenaires* pour *le développement des compétences des travailleurs* en *renforçant les instituts de formation* souligne l'atteinte de ces objectifs.

Ces réalisations ont le mérite d'avoir posé le premier jalon (dans cette ambitieuse entreprise de l'Education) dans l'amélioration de la qualité de l'enseignement général, professionnel et technique.

La réalisation de ces objectifs prioritaires pour le Gouvernement n'aurait pu se concrétiser sans le concours bienveillant de notre partenaire, la Banque Mondiale. Sa compréhension et son accompagnement manifestés à travers les missions depuis la mise en vigueur retardée jusqu'à la fin du Projet ont beaucoup aidé les autorités comoriennes. Toute notre reconnaissance à cette institution partenaire.

